

# Evolution & Efficacy of Policy Instruments

**Richard Schmalensee**

Harvard Workshop on the Economics of the Clean Air Act  
In commemoration of the 50<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of the Act

January 8, 2021

# The (24-Page!) 1970 CAA Relied on Traditional Standard Setting

- EPA to set national air quality standards for “criteria pollutants”
  - States to be responsible for meeting them (flexibility)
- EPA to set national standards for new power plants & motor vehicles, fuels standards optional
- EPA to set emissions standards for (many) “air toxics”

## Evolution 1970-1990: *Broadly* Toward More Flexibility, Driven by Practical & Political Problems, Not Ideology or Economics

- Can't build in non-attainment areas → Trading within, between firms (1974, 1977)
- Can't defeat Eastern coal in Congress → Scrubbers required on new coal plants (1977)
- Major cost differences among lead additive producers → Trading (1982)
- Autos complained at lack of fuels regulation → Standards for fuels (1990)
- Multiple Command & Control acid rain bills failed → Trading (1990)
- Can't develop emissions standards for air toxics → Back to technology standards (1990)
- No framework for Montreal Protocol phaseout → Cap & trade + tax (1990)

# And Then the Music Stopped

- 1970, 1977, and 1990 Amendments were passed with large, bipartisan majorities; the UNFCCC was ratified in 1992 by voice vote
- After 1990, environmental policy, like much else, became increasingly partisan, and new legislation to deal with emerging problems became impossible
- **NO<sub>x</sub>/ozone transport:** Interstate trading attempted by EPA 1999+, Courts ruled that CAA did not enable, no interstate trading since 2015
- **Climate:** CO<sub>2</sub> regulation under the CAA required 2007-09; Waxman-Markey failed 2010; Obama's kluge regulations undone by Trump...

A polar bear is perched on a small, isolated piece of white ice. The surrounding ocean is a vast, dark blue expanse completely covered with a dense layer of plastic waste, including bottles, bags, and other debris. The sky is a clear, pale blue. The overall scene is a powerful visual metaphor for the impact of plastic pollution on the environment.

Let's Hope That Things Change!